

HAYDN: Online Journal of the Haydn Society of North America

Volume 14 (2024): *Reassessing Haydn's Sacred Music*

Article 1

10-21-2024

Reassessing Haydn's Sacred Music: Abstracts of Published Conference Papers

Michael E. Ruhling

Rochester Institute of Technology, mergsl@rit.edu

Follow this and additional works at: <https://remix.berklee.edu/haydn-journal>



Part of the [Music Education Commons](#), [Musicology Commons](#), [Music Pedagogy Commons](#), [Music Performance Commons](#), [Music Practice Commons](#), and the [Music Theory Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Ruhling, Michael E. (2024) "Reassessing Haydn's Sacred Music: Abstracts of Published Conference Papers," *HAYDN: Online Journal of the Haydn Society of North America*: Vol. 14, Article 1.
Available at: <https://remix.berklee.edu/haydn-journal/vol14/iss1/1>

© Haydn Society of North America ; Boston: Berklee Library, 2024. Duplication without the express permission of the author and/or the Haydn Society of North America is prohibited.

Reassessing Haydn's Sacred Music: Abstracts of Published Conference Papers

by Michael E. Ruhling

The international conference "Reassessing Haydn's Sacred Music" held in Eisenstadt in June of 2023, yielded some thoughtful and new perspectives on the structures, aesthetics, performance situations, and influences related to this repertoire. Robert B. Wrigley's thorough report on the conference appeared last year in volume 13 of this journal (<https://remix.berklee.edu/haydn-journal/vol13/iss1/4/>), and I encourage you to read it. Along with the Internationale Joseph Haydn Privatstiftung Eisenstadt, the Haydn Society of North America wishes to thank the following organizations for their support of the 2023 "Reassessing Haydn's Sacred Music" conference: Government of Burgenland, Botstiber Institute for Austrian-American Studies, Raiffeisenlandesbank Burgenland, School of Performing Arts of the Rochester (NY) Institute of Technology, Joseph Haydn Privathochschule, and the Barmherzige Brüder Hospital and Convent.

The HSNA and Internationale Joseph Haydn Privatstiftung Eisenstadt (IHS) are publishing many of the conference papers. The current volume 14 of *HAYDN: Online Journal of the Haydn Society of North America* includes papers by Dexter Edge and Janet K. Page on Marian works by Haydn, which feature many beautiful and interesting plates of primary sources. Keeping with the Marian topics, this volume of *HAYDN Online* also includes an article by Henry Stratmann proposing a Rosary-inspired reading of some of Haydn's symphonies from the late 1760s and early 1770s. Other conference papers, along with some additional Haydn studies will be published in the *Eisenstädter Haydn-Berichte, Vol. 13: Haydn, Sacred Music, and Perspectives of the Viennese Classical Triad* (Vienna: Hollitzer), edited by Walter Reicher and Michael Ruhling, which should be available in February or March 2025.

Below are the abstracts (in English) of the conference papers in both this volume of *HAYDN Online* and *EHB13: Haydn, Sacred Music, and Perspectives of the Viennese Classical Triad*, along with brief descriptions of the additional (non-conference) chapters in *EHB13*.

In *HAYDN: Online Journal of the Haydn Society of North America*, vol. 14 (2024).

Janet K. Page, "*Mater dolorum* settings by Georg Reutter the Younger and Gregor Werner, as reflected in music by Joseph Haydn."

Mater dolorum, a text by Heinrich Rademin (1674–1731), is a German-language oratorio intended for performance before a model of the Holy Sepulcher on Good Friday. Such works, amalgamating court sepulcro and popular traditions, were performed in churches throughout Central Europe during Holy Week. *Mater dolorum*, one of the most popular texts, was set by three of Haydn's older contemporaries: Georg Reutter Jr. (1726), Gregor Werner (ca. 1733), and Georg Christoph Wagenseil (ca. 1739). In this essay, I consider how these settings, and the attitudes displayed in them, intersected with Haydn's world and could have influenced him, especially in his own Passiontide music, the *Stabat mater dolorosa* (1767) and *Die Sieben letzten Worte* (1785). Points of resemblance include reminiscences of older musical practices, text painting, structural organization, and treatment of slow movements.

Dexter Edge, "The Context and Early Reception of Haydn's *Stabat mater*."

Haydn spent his formative musical years in Vienna, a city with a strong Marian cult that was expressed musically through such works in German as Heinrich Rademin's *Mater dolorum* (set by Werner, Reutter the Younger, and Wagenseil), and by innumerable settings of the Latin sequence *Stabat mater*. In Vienna, musical settings of the *Stabat mater* were traditionally performed not only on the feast of *Septem Dolorum B. V. M.*, but also on Saturdays in Lent and during Holy Week. In fact, we now know that Haydn sang *a cappella* settings of the *Stabat mater* by Palestrina and Reutter in the mid 1750s when he was hired as a supplementary chorister by the Hofmusikkapelle for performances in Holy Week. Thus it is not surprising that Haydn chose to set the *Stabat mater* as one of his first major sacred vocal works after succeeding Werner as Kapellmeister for Prince Esterhazy in 1766.

This paper traces the history and reception of Haydn's *Stabat mater*, beginning with his own early experiences performing and hearing settings by other composers (particularly those of Palestrina and Reutter), through the earliest performances of Haydn's own setting, and its gradual spread into France, England, Italy, Protestant Germany, and North America. By the 1780s, it was one

of Haydn's best known works, and certainly his best known vocal work, often considered a rival to Pergolesi's perennially popular setting. My paper gathers together well known, poorly known, and new documents on the reception and early performances of Haydn's *Stabat mater*, including previously unknown performances of the work in England and Germany.

In *Eisenstädter Haydn-Berichte, Vol. 13: Haydn, Sacred Music, and Perspectives of the Viennese Classical Triad.*

Abstracts of Conference Papers

Jakob Johannes Koch, "The Music-liturgical Signatures in the Context of Haydn's Oeuvre and Impact."

Joseph Haydn was a practicing Catholic throughout his life. Until the end of his life, he personally experienced all Catholic – for a time also Anglican – forms of worship many times and on a regular basis, except for the papal liturgy. But at his time, church music which is not performed by clergy is not officially part of the liturgy. Later, Haydn encountered the post-Josephinian liturgy on the threshold of the Restoration; much changed in church music. All of this is engraved into his liturgical and sacred compositions, in both form and content. For this reason, they can only be fully grasped with a deeper knowledge of the overall music-liturgical signature of his epoch as well as his geographic spheres of influence and reception.

Catholic worship is documented in the liturgical books of the Church, as well as in the prayer, devotional and hymn books. From them one can see which ceremonies, rites and rubrics are valid. But the doctrine and cult of the church, despite their claim to supra-temporal objectivity, have their very own character in each epoch and especially in their intervening phases. In order to gain an insight into the music-liturgical context of Haydn's time, it is not enough to simply look up church documents; the paraliturgical sources of the extremely multifaceted popular piety must also be considered as con- and subtext.

James I. Armstrong, "Joseph Haydn's Church Music in Esterházy Religious Practice."

In addressing the rich body of music composed by Joseph Haydn for Catholic worship, many scholars have focused largely on the works themselves, leaving discussion of their relationship to Catholic

liturgy and para-liturgical worship as a secondary concern. An Esterházy order of worship (1800) and a list drawn up by Esterházy bass singer Johann Bader (1764-1829) of 415 services undertaken by the Esterházy church music ensemble in 1810 provide an unparalleled resource for understanding the relationship of the music listed by Bader to the particular religious practices followed at court. Of the nearly 30 different church works in the Esterházy Church Music Collection attributed to Haydn and available to Haydn's successor, Johann Nepomuk Fuchs (1766-1839), for use in the year following Haydn's death, it was primarily his late Masses – the "Missa in tempore belli" and the "Missa in angustiis", as well as his "Schöpfungsmesse" and "Harmoniemesse" – that were performed. Though Bader's 32 references to Haydn's church music represent a small fraction of the church works mentioned in Bader's "Verzeichniß", Haydn's Masses played a disproportionately large role in worship at the Esterházy court in 1810. These works appear already to have formed a canon and were used to mark the most important events at court. The church music ensemble performed his Masses on more than a third of the 21 high feasts of the church year, and it was Haydn's Masses that were sung and played to welcome Nicolaus II Esterházy (1765-1833) and his consort Maria Hermenegilde (1768-1845) home from their travels and to celebrate their birthdays and name days. Of special interest is the performance of the "Harmoniemesse", "Missa in angustiis" and "Missa in tempore belli" during the Forty Hours' Devotion held during Pentecost and the two days following – an observance of singular symbolic importance at the Esterházy court. This devotional practice, like the Feast of the Most Holy Name of the B.V.M. (Mariä Namen), has its roots in the horrors of war and the need to pray for deliverance and peace. It is commonly thought that the titles of the second and third of the three Masses were inspired by the hardships Austria encountered in the wars fought against Napoleon. It is less well known that these Masses by Haydn may have been conceived to conform to a special liturgical service of worship, the *Missa Tempore Belli*, and as such were particularly fitting choices for the Forty Hours' Devotion.

Michael E. Ruhling, "Catholic Enlightenment Eucharistic Perspectives and Self-Quotation in Haydn's Masses."

Recent research regarding previously marginalized Catholic intellectuals during the Enlightenment has reconsidered late 18th-century thought and practices in Catholic Europe, notably the Habsburg lands, and generated a new and developing canon of "Catholic Enlightenment" principles. While most

of the Catholic Enlightenment research of the Habsburg empire has focused on political and societal aspects of the Church-State relationship, many of the 18th-century Catholic intellectuals addressed the rebalancing of the Rational–Sensual dualism in relation to a proper and “reasoned” approach to worship and devotion, particularly in assessing the mystery of the sacraments, through new Enlightenment-informed evaluations of the premises of Council of Trent. Consistent with other Catholic contemporaries, Lodovico Muratori, perhaps the most widely influential of the Catholic Enlightenment authors in the Italian and Austrian lands, cautioned against the Jesuitical over-emphasis on devotion to saints that drew away from proper focus on the salvific act of Christ, but in matters of the sacraments, particularly Penance and the Eucharist, Muratori clearly advocated for a proper understanding and acceptance of God’s *sensual* experience through the Incarnation, and the *sensual* nature of believers’ engagement with God in the sacraments. Muratori’s widely translated and published *The Science of Rational Devotion* (1747) clearly and vividly communicate these principles, and credits their foundation in the Council of Trent. Muratori’s older contemporary St. Alphonsus Liguori offers similar devotional direction in his broadly distributed and highly cherished book *Visits to the Most Holy Sacrament and the Blessed Virgin Mary* (1745), urging the sensual relationship to Christ in the Eucharist akin to the perfect marital bond. These devotional texts show influences across the Habsburg lands, including in the Eucharistic devotional practices of Joseph II.

In this study, this context of prevailing Catholic Enlightenment thought regarding the balance of the rational and the sensual in worship is the foundation for considering a “sensual voice” in Joseph Haydn’s masses, accompanying those texts related to the Incarnation and that point towards the *raison d’être* of the mass liturgy—the Eucharist—where believers regularly engage sensually with their God; namely the Gloria’s “Qui tollis,” Credo’s “Et incarnatus est,” the Benedictus, and at times the Agnus Dei. Haydn seems to share Muratori’s and Alphonsus’s connection between the Eucharistic engagement and marital bond, for in the only three instances of Haydn self-quoting other vocal material for setting these mass texts, the quoted material originally set texts related to marital relationships. This suggests that in Haydn’s musical-dramatic planning, the Eucharist and the nuptial bond do, indeed, share a common sensual experience. However, in each case, Haydn skillfully recasts the original secular material in ways that make it appropriate for the solemnity of the liturgical occasion, and respectful of the sacramental mystery.

James Webster, "The Two Personalities of Haydn's Masses."

Joseph Haydn's liturgical vocal works, especially his late Mass settings, were traditionally criticized for lack of 'dignity', 'gravity', and so forth; for being light or "playful" in style, if not indeed "dance-like" or "trifling"; for having been composed not 'freely' but 'on commission', for the Esterházy court, in honor of the name-day of the Prince's consort. In a different vein, they have been criticized for a supposed lack of fit between the canonical texts and their musical settings, which are often characterized as naïve, sentimental, or merely pretty; as well as for their occasional omissions of certain key textual passages.

The governing concept behind all these criticisms is *propriety*: the notion that, since the church is a holy place and the Mass an official liturgical observance, a musical setting should *fit* — be 'proper' to — this setting and purpose. Crucially, the concept unites the social-religious domain and the musical-stylistic domain, such that a mere musical 'impropriety' could seem at the same time a violation of something more fundamental.

The paper will offer a refutation of the notion that Haydn's masses lack propriety, based on two fundamental theses. (1) There is a complex dialectic between the personality of the man Joseph Haydn, and the 'musical personality' (the *persona*) we hear in his works. An appropriate understanding of this dialectic is directly relevant to adequate reception of his sacred vocal music. (2) Haydn's personality and musical persona both exhibited a duality between earnestness and humor. This duality is no less central to his vocal music, sacred and secular, than to his instrumental music. The presence of 'two personalities' in Haydn's masses, far from being surprising, is precisely what we should expect; far from being a defect, it is what we should cherish.

James MacKay, "Joseph Haydn's Baroque Heritage: The Influence of Johann Joseph Fux and Georg Reutter on Two Early Haydn Masses (Hob.XXII:1 and 5)."

Though one seldom thinks of Joseph Haydn, father of the Classical symphony and string quartet, as being a Baroque composer, his early training as a choirboy in Vienna in the 1740s had a distinctly Baroque bent. Both Georg Reutter, who auditioned Haydn in 1739 as a vocalist, and recruited him for the St. Stephen's Cathedral Choir in Vienna the following year, and Johann Joseph Fux (author of the groundbreaking counterpoint treatise *Gradus ad Parnassum*, and musically influential in Vienna until

his death in 1741), were known for their stile antico church music in mid-18th century Viennese circles, music that the young Haydn would have had ample opportunity to perform as a choral singer.

One work of Haydn that dates from these formative years, considered to be his only authenticated composition written during the Baroque period (i.e., prior to 1750), is his *Missa Brevis* in F major, Hoboken XXII:1. When a manuscript of the work came to Haydn's attention in 1805, he authenticated it as having been written in 1749, and commended it for its "youthful fire." This paper, building upon prior considerations of the work by James Dack, H. C. Robbins Landon, and Denis McCaldin, will provide an in-depth analysis of Haydn's *Missa Brevis* in F, with particular attention given to its melodic, harmonic, textural, and contrapuntal design, as well as possible musical antecedents in choral works of Reutter and Fux.

A further discussion will examine parallels between Haydn's Hob. XXII: 1 and his *Missa Cellensis*, Hob. XXII: 5, composed in 1766 shortly after he was promoted to full Kapellmeister at Eszterháza, and revised in 1773 after the original manuscript was destroyed by a 1768 fire in his quarters. Through close examination of these masses, this study will demonstrate how vestiges of Viennese Baroque compositional practice, as imparted to Haydn by Reutter and Fux, profoundly influenced his compositional decisions and musical language in these and other early vocal works.

Ryuichi Higuchi, "Haydn's Kirchenmusik und Johann Sebastian Bach."

The Fürstlich Esterhazysche Musikarchiv in Eisenstadt owns a complete copy of Johann Sebastian Bach's Mass in B minor, which apparently came into this collection after the death of Joseph Haydn via Prince Nicolaus II Esterházy. Because this manuscript is mentioned in the "Traeg Catalog" in 1804, it can be assumed that Haydn acquired it from this music dealer. But what for? He had already completed his mass setting in 1802 with the "Harmoniemesse."

Recent Bach research clarified the provenance of this copy. The paper comes from a paper mill in the Potsdam district and the unknown scribe "Anon. 403" was a professional copyist under Johann Phillip Kirnberger (1721–1783) in Berlin. This student of Bach was at that time the composition teacher of Anna Amalia of Prussia and traveled to Hamburg in 1769 to borrow the autograph score of the B minor Mass from Carl Phillip Emanuel Bach and then to have some copies made of it in Berlin. This resulted in the copy in the Amalienbibliothek (BB Am. B. 3), which served as a model for another copy kept in the Amalienbibliothek (BB Am. B. 1-2), as well as the copy that is currently in Eisenstadt.

Because this Eisenstadt copy contains some entries in the hand of Gottfried van Swieten, it can be concluded that the baron received it from the hand of Kirnberger during his tenure as Habsburg envoy in Berlin in 1770–77 and brought it with him to Vienna in 1777. In this context, Ulrich Leisinger argued at the 2007 Belfast Congress that the Freiherr provided this manuscript to Wolfgang Amadé Mozart, who may have used it sometime 1782–83 in the composition of his Mass in C minor, KV427. Haydn was a close friend of Mozart and must have known this story well. But he was busy at that time as Kapellmeister of Prince Nicolaus I Esterházy with the operas for Eszterhaz, and so was not in a position to compose an extensive mass. The Josephinian reform also played an important role.

Upon Haydn's return from London in 1795 following the death of Prince Anton, he began to compose his "Six Great Masses" (and the two oratorios) in the service of Nicolaus II (1794–1814). His composition of both oratorios (1796–1801) meant a close collaboration with Baron Gottfried van Swieten as translator and librettist, and sometimes as one who stuck his nose into Haydn's composition. This paper examines Haydn's Six Great Masses in this context, noting that Haydn added more and more chromatic features, especially to the fugue themes, and suggesting the possibility he was influenced by the chromatic theme of the Kyrie fugue in Bach's Mass in B minor.

Mikhail Kuchersky, "Einblicke in die Kontexte der Kirchenmusik am Hofe des Fürsten Nikolaus II. Esterházy nach Haydn's Dienst in Eisenstadt."

Based on source studies in the archives of the Esterházy Private Foundation at Forchtenstein Castle (Burgenland/Austria) and in the Széchényi National Library in Budapest, the study focuses first on the extent to which Haydn's sacred music was heard at the Esterházy court under Nicholas II in the years after 1803. Haydn's sacred music, among other works, was performed primarily by boys who had been trained at the Kapellknabeninstitut (Chapel Boys' Institute) established by the Esterházy dynasty from 1804 to 1811. The study of this hitherto insufficiently researched educational institution during the heyday of the Esterházy court is a second aspect of this study. Here, a reconstruction of the context of the history of music institutions is carried out, in the context of which church music played a particularly important role. After a sketchy description of the tasks of the Boys' Choir, it focuses on the teaching program, the support of the boys through scholarships, and the various career prospects after their education. This educational institution was significantly influenced by Haydn's successor, Johann Nepomuk Fuchs, whose church music activities are finally discussed.

Molly Clydermann-Weber, "Coming to America: Haydn's Hymn Tunes in the American Presbyterian Church."

Of the more than sixty hymn tunes attributed to Franz Joseph Haydn's astonishing musical legacy, none enjoys more popularity in American hymnals than his "Kaiserlied," often referred to as "Austria" or "Austrian Hymn." The tune, most often set with the text "Glorious Things of Thee are Spoken," appears in nearly 600 hymnals published in the United States. This paper situates the usage of Haydn's hymn tunes within the larger, American sacred musical scene of the 19th and 20th centuries by addressing the importance of England as a node of connection between Austria and the United States, the role of Lowell Mason in popularizing Haydn's hymn tunes in the United States in the 19th century, and the diversifying hymnal reforms within the Presbyterian Church in the 20th century. This paper gives particular attention to the "Kaiserlied," tracing the tune from its first public performance in 1797 through the publication of three settings in the Presbyterian Church U.S.A.'s "Worship and Rejoice" hymnal in 2001.

Marko Motnik, "Joseph Haydn und die Philharmonische Gesellschaft zu Laibach - Die Überlieferung von Haydns (Kirchen-) Musik im heutigen Slowenien."

When looking through the music collections of church institutions in Slovenia today, not much of Joseph Haydn's sacred compositions can be found. While the church music reform movements of the 19th century (Cecilianism) in Carniola rigorously "sorted out" compositions by the Viennese classics so as to make scarce their works in music archives today, in the areas of present-day Slovenian Styria older musical material was treated with more care. The church archive in Pettau (today Ptuj) preserves a large number of individual choruses, ensembles and arias from Haydn's oratorios for church use, and the archive of the parish church in Cilli (today Celje) contains an unusually large number of contrafacta. The existence of Haydn's compositions is closely linked to the presence and activity of individuals in these two places, thus indicating the existence of personal networks. The Philharmonic Society of Ljubljana is a particularly important case of personal networking. With the help of such networks and acquaintances, representatives of the Philharmonic Society paid Haydn a visit in Vienna in 1800, appointed him an honorary member, and received a copy of his *Missa in tempore belli* from the composer himself. Haydn's oratorios and symphonies were undoubtedly more important for the repertoire of the Philharmonic Society, and the cultivation of church music was not

one of the Society's main goals, but it did support annual Cecilian festivals in the Jakobskirche in Ljubljana and regularly held memorial masses there for deceased honorary members.

Descriptions of Other Chapters in EHB13

Klaus Petermayr, "Neue Überlegungen und Erkenntnisse zu Joseph Haydns „Missa Cellensis“, Hob.XXII:5."

_____, "Joseph Haydns „Applausus“. Gedanken zu einem unterschätzten Werk."

Klaus Petermayr reviews the materials regarding aspects of the genesis and conditions surrounding earliest performances of Haydn's early works the Applausus Cantata and Missa Cellensis. In the case of the Applausus Cantata, Petermayr suggests other orchestral works that may have been performed alongside the cantata based on archival and internal evidence of probable instrumentation availability.

Thomas Baust, "Haydns 'Schöpfung' als politisches Fanal."

Performance history and Cold War politics are drawn together by Thomas Baust. Haydn's *The Creation* received its first Leipzig performance in 1800 at the Paulinerkirche, which had served as the Leipzig University chapel since the Reformation. Almost 270 years later, Haydn's great oratorio was at the center of controversy related to the destruction of the Paulinerkirche to "improve" the Karl-Marx-Platz, ordered by officials of the GDR.

Thomas Tolley, "Consigning Haydn, Mozart and Beethoven to the Grate? Satirical Perspectives on the Triumvirate from Regency Britain."

By carefully analyzing the satirical iconography of Edward Burney's painting "Amateurs of Tye-Wig Music," Thomas Tolley gives an insightful, in-depth interpretation of how Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven, among other composers, were thought of in early 19th-century London. This oil painting by the nephew of the music historian Dr. Charles Burney hangs in the Tate Gallery in London, and is given the date c.1836–c.1840. However, Tolley presents evidence that 1817 is a more plausible date, thereby giving a significantly earlier dating to any reception implications regarding to the Viennese Classical Triade than the Tate London date would suggest.

Ruhling, Michael E. "Reassessing Haydn's Sacred Music: Abstracts of Published Conference Papers."

HAYDN: Online Journal of the Haydn Society of North America 14 (2024), <https://remix.berklee.edu/haydn-journal>

© Haydn Society of North America, and Boston: Berklee Library, 2024. Duplication without the express permission of the author and/or the Haydn Society of North America is prohibited.

James MacKay, "Beethoven's Haydnesque Heritage: Echoes of Haydn's Opp. 17 and 20 String Quartets in Beethoven's Op. 18."

Using stylistic analysis, James MacKay argues that Beethoven's Op. 18 string quartets show interesting similarities with, if not outright modelling of, some of Haydn's early quartets. MacKay traces compositional designs and fugal techniques in the Haydn works that seem to have directly influenced Beethoven's earliest set of quartets, especially Op. 18 nos. 3 and 4.

Mikhail Kuchersky, "Johann Nepomuk Hummel and the Triad of Viennese Classicism."

Mikhail Kuchersky places Haydn's Eisenstadt successor Hummel within the context of Viennese Classicism. While Hummel's connection to Haydn would seem likely, Kuchersky uses documents from various archives to demonstrate Hummel's debt to all three Viennese Classical composers.